

**Bay Area Community Colleges Information Competency Assessment Project**  
**Information Competency Proficiency Exam – Part B: Performance Component**  
**SCORING MANUAL (Version 2.32)**

Test item	Criteria to apply	What constitutes competent	Notes on scoring	Score, and weighted score
<b>EXERCISE I -- B.1.a Narrowed topic</b>				
B.1.a Your instructor has given you the broad subject <b>civil rights in America</b> and an assignment to write a 3-5 page research paper on some aspect of this subject. Narrow this subject to a manageable topic for the assignment.	B.1.a Criterion 1 – Topic is narrowed by specifying time frame, or persons, or organization or group, or location, or event or incident, or some combination of these, or other similar, appropriate limiter(s) is (are) applied. <b>AND</b>	B.1.a At least one of the narrowing techniques has been applied to the subject. <b>AND</b> The other 2 criteria are met.	B.1.a Broad topic is civil rights in America Examples of appropriately narrowed topics ✓ <i>Status of Arab American Civil Rights After 9/11</i> [narrowed by time frame and group] ✓ <i>Effects of the UC system prohibiting race-based admission criteria</i> [narrowed by organization and event] Example of a topic not properly narrowed ✓ <i>The civil rights movement in America, equality then and now</i> [no time period, incident, or group used to focus]	B.1.a Criterion 1=1 Criterion 2=1 Criterion 3=1  3 out of 3 = 1 0, 1, or 2 out of 3 = 0  Possible scores 1, 0  <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 6</b> <b>0 = 0</b>
	Criterion 2 – Narrowed topic is within subject assigned. <b>AND</b>		Example of topic that is <i>not</i> within subject assigned ✓ <i>The two sides fighting the Civil War</i>	
	Criterion 3 -- Narrowed topic is appropriate to a 3-5 page research paper.		Examples of appropriate topics for a 3-5 page paper ✓ <i>Civil rights of American-Japanese during World War II</i> ✓ <i>Black American civil rights from 1960-1966</i> Examples of topics that are too broad ✓ <i>The rights of Americans</i> ✓ <i>Black Americans' civil rights</i>	
<b>B.1.b Steps taken to develop narrowed topic</b>				
B.1.b In two or three sentences, describe in detail what you did to develop your narrowed topic.	B.1.b Criterion 1 – The student describes the process used to consult additional resources, such as background information sources, to develop a narrowed topic. <b>AND/OR</b>  (continued on next page)	B.1.b What the student writes indicates that the process used meets Criterion 1 <b>AND/OR</b> Criterion 2	B.1.b The response should be in sentences, or, at the very least, easily understandable. Example of an appropriate response ✓ <i>I went to the Encyclopedia Americana and looked up “Civil Rights and Liberties.” The subsections of the big article were laid out in such a way that I could identify a narrower topic that interested me.</i>  Example of an inadequate response: ✓ <i>First I brainstormed possible specific ideas. Then I narrowed the ideas down.</i> ✓ <i>I went to Alice and typed civil rights in America and got a lot of results.</i>  (continued on next page)	B.1.b Criterion 1 = 1 Criterion 2 = 1  1 or 2 = 1 0 = 0  Possible scores 1, 0  <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 6</b> <b>0 = 0</b>

Test item	Criteria to apply	What constitutes competent	Notes on scoring	Score, and weighted score
	Criterion 2 – The student describes the process used to implement his/her own prior knowledge to develop a narrowed topic.		Example of an appropriate response ✓ <i>I tried to think of a specific incident in the civil rights movement. I remembered Rosa Parks and decided to focus on her famous action in the bus and its consequences. What were the consequences of her action?</i>	
<b>B.2 Posing the research question</b>				
B.2 Next, take your narrowed topic and pose it as a research question that you could adequately address in this 3-5 page writing assignment.	B.2 Criterion 1 – The student composes a research question that contains a subject. <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 – The question is a recognizable <i>type</i> of question (such as a question of fact; a posited hypothesis; some topic for comparing/contrasting; or it is a probing or investigative question; etc.) <b>AND</b> Criterion 3 – The research question is within the narrowed topic <b>AND</b> Criterion 4 – The research question is appropriate to the assignment	B.2 The research question meets ALL of the 4 criteria.	B.2 Example of a research question that does not contain a subject ✓ <i>What are the effects?</i>  Examples of appropriate responses ✓ <i>What arguments did the lawyers make in the 1954 Brown v. Board of Education Supreme Court case? [question of fact]</i> ✓ <i>How has the tragedy of September 11 affected the civil rights of Arabs and Muslims living in America? [investigative question]</i>  Example of inappropriate response ✓ <i>Black movement in respect to civil rights. [not a research question]</i>  Look back at the narrowed topic – is the research question within that topic?  Keeping in mind the 3-5 page research paper assignment, is the research question appropriate?	B.2 Criterion 1 = 1 Criterion 2 = 1 Criterion 3 = 1 Criterion 4 = 1  4 out of 4 = 1 0, 1, 2, or 3 out of 4 = 0  Possible scores 1, 0  <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 6</b> <b>0 = 0</b>
<b>EXERCISE II - B.3.a.1,b.1,c.1 Three key concepts</b>				
B.3.a.1,b.1,c.1 You've been given the assignment to write a 3-5 page research paper on the following question: <b>Should colleges be allowed to restrict student speech?</b> Write in the key concepts represented by the research question.	B.3.a.1,b.1,c.1 The student identifies 2 or 3 distinct main concepts represented by the research question.	B.3.a.1,b.1,c.1 The student identifies 2 or 3 distinct main concepts which are 1) colleges or higher education; 2) speech; 3) restriction or censorship.	B.3.a.1,b.1,c.1 Appropriate responses <i>Key concept 1: colleges</i> <i>Key concept 2: speech</i> <i>Key concept 3: censorship</i>	B.3.a.1,b.1,c.1 Each distinct key concept = 1 2 or 3 out of 3 = 1 0 or 1 out of 3 = 0 Possible scores 1, 0 <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 6</b> <b>0 = 0</b>

Test item	Criteria to apply	What constitutes competent	Notes on scoring	Score, and weighted score
<b>B.3.a.2-3,b.2-3,c.2-3 Synonyms or alternate terms</b>				
<p>B.3.a.2-3,b.2-3, c.2-3 Then write in synonyms or alternate terms for each concept that you would use in searching for information on this question.</p>	<p>B.3.a.2-3,b.2-3,c.2-3 The student identifies a total of 4 (out of a possible 6) appropriate alternate terms or synonyms for the key concepts.</p>	<p>B.3.a.2-3,b.2-3,c.2-3 The response meets the criterion.</p>	<p>B.3.a.2-3,b.2-3,c.2-3 Examples of appropriate responses <i>Key concept 1 synonym 1: universities</i> <i>Key concept 1 synonym 2: higher education</i> <i>Key concept 2 synonym 1: free expression</i> <i>Key concept 2 synonym 2: 1st amendment rights</i> <i>Key concept 3 synonym 1: restrain</i> <i>Key concept 3 synonym 2: restrict</i></p>	<p>B.3.a.2-3,b.2-3,c.2-3 Each appropriate alternate term or synonym = 1 4, 5 or 6 out of 6 = 1 0, 1, 2, or 3 out of 6 = 0  Possible scores 1, 0  <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 6</b> <b>0 = 0</b></p>
<b>B.4* Style guide</b>				
<p>B.4* What citation format will you be using (e.g., MLA, APA, CBE)?</p>		<p>B.4* Style guide is specified.</p>	<p>B.4* Style guide is specified in such a way that it is obvious which format is being utilized. Edition statement not required.</p>	<p>B.4* Style guide is appropriately specified = 1 Not specified, or not specified appropriately = 0  Possible scores 1,0  <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 1</b> <b>0 = 0</b></p>

Test item	Criteria to apply	What constitutes competent	Notes on scoring	Score, and weighted score
<b>B.4.a.1,b.1,c.1 Resources on the topic: Selecting &amp; citing</b>				
<p>B.4.a.1,b.1,c.1 Identify 3 relevant sources for this topic research question: one book; one periodical article; one Web site. Carefully select your sources based on standard evaluative criteria for college research papers. For each source you will:</p> <p>a) Write a complete bibliographic citation using a standard citation format; b) Describe how you found the source; c) Explain why you chose the source. Your responses will be scored partially on how specific they are, so notes may be useful.</p> <p>a. Write a complete bibliographic citation for the source using the citation format you noted above. Use an underscore ( _ ) before and after bibliographic elements that are underlined. (This exam does not allow you to indent.)</p>	<p>B.4.a.1,b.1,c.1 Criterion 1 – Resource cited is on the topic. <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 – Resource is of suitable quality for a college-level research paper. <b>AND</b> Criterion 3 – All the elements are included, following a standard citation style. <b>AND</b> Criterion 4 – There are no more than a few formatting errors such as incorrect punctuation or incorrect sequence of elements.</p>	<p>B.4.a.1,b.1,c.1 Competence for this item is broken into 3 parts.</p> <p>Criterion 1 is met when the source is judged to be on the topic.</p> <p>Criterion 2 is met when the source is judged to be of suitable quality for college-level research.</p> <p>Criteria 3 and 4 are judged together, i.e., when Criterion 3 <b>AND</b> Criterion 4 are met, the full weighted score is assigned.</p>	<p>B.4.a.1,b.1,c.1 It should be very clear from the citation what type of source (book, periodical article, etc.) is being represented.</p> <p>Example of inadequate citations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>Haiman, Franklin S. "Speech Acts and the First Amendment." 1993 Illinois, pg. 81</i></li> <li>✓ <i>The Corporate Threat to Free Speech in the United States. 2002.</i></li> <li>✓ <i>Hemingway, Ernest. Restricted Speech News. Jan. 2002:114.</i></li> <li>✓ <i>Feminism and Suffrage. DuBois, Ellen Carol. 1947.</i></li> </ul>	<p>B.4.a.1,b.1,c.1 <b>Note</b> This test item is separated into 3 weighted scores. The 1st score is comprised of criterion 1; the 2nd score is comprised of criterion 2; the 3rd score is comprised of criteria 3 and 4.</p> <p>Criterion 1 = 1 1 out of 1 = 1 0 out of 1 = 0 Possible scores 1, 0 <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 2</b> <b>0 = 0</b></p> <p>Criterion 2 = 1 1 out of 1 = 1 0 out of 1 = 0 Possible scores 1, 0 <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 2</b> <b>0 = 0</b></p> <p>Criterion 3 = 1 Criterion 4 = 1 2 out of 2 = 1 0, 1 out of 2 = 0 Possible scores 1, 0 <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 1</b> <b>0 = 0</b></p> <p><b>NOTE: scoring is applied to 4.a.1, 4.b.1, and 4.c.1</b></p>

Test item	Criteria to apply	What constitutes competent	Notes on scoring	Score, and weighted score
<b>B.4.a.2,b.2,c.2 How found source?</b>				
B.4.a.2,b.2,c.2 How did you find this source? In two or three sentences, describe your steps, including the search tool(s) used and how you performed the search.	B.4.a.2,b.2,c.2 Criterion 1 – The student identifies tool(s) used. <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 – The student identifies an appropriate technique or strategy for using the tool(s).	B.4.a.2,b.2,c.2 Criterion 1 <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 are met	B.4.a.2,b.2,c.2 Examples of appropriate responses ✓ <i>I used fulltext resources available through my library's homepage. I selected an academic database, and limited my search to peer reviewed articles. The subject terms I used were "censorship" and "colleges."</i> ✓ <i>I accessed the college library homepage and click on "articles." I accessed InfoTrac Expanded Academic ASAP and searched the articles for university AND "free speech." I chose this article as the best.</i> Examples of inadequate responses ✓ <i>Searched the catalog</i> ✓ <i>Looked for articles about the topic in ProQuest.</i>	B.4.a.2,b.2,c.2 Criterion 1 = 1 Criterion 2 = 1  2 out of 2 = 1 0 or 1 out of 2 = 0  Possible scores 1, 0  <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 3</b> <b>0 = 0</b>  <b>NOTE: scoring is applied to 4.a.2, 4.b.2, and 4.c.2</b>
<b>B.4.a.3,b.3.c.3 Why chose source?</b>				
B.4.a.3,b.3.c.3 Why did you choose this particular source (e.g., book, Web page, or article)? In two or three sentences, provide at least two reasons that explain why you selected this particular source.	B.4.a.3,b.3.c.3 Criterion 1 – The student describes at least 2 reasons for selection of the resource. <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 – The reasons are based on standard evaluative criteria and/or the student explains how the resource contributes to research on the topic.	B.4.a.3,b.3.c.3 Criterion 1 <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 are met.	B.4.a.3,b.3.c.3 At least 2 reasons are given to support selection of the source. The reasons reflect standard evaluative criteria and/or the student explains how the source contributes to the research effort.  Examples of appropriate responses ✓ <i>This book has a reputable publisher. It covers two centuries of student movements ranging from Russia to Western Europe to US. It could be good for comparative approaches.</i> ✓ <i>I chose this source because it is a reputable and well-known organization [ACLU]. Additionally, it appeared to have information current through today on issues surrounding my research topic.</i> Examples of inadequate responses: ✓ <i>EBSCOhost has tons of articles</i> ✓ <i>The article was relevant</i> ✓ <i>I know how to use this resource, so I did</i> ✓ <i>It gives background information of the issue [only one reason given.]</i>	B.4.a.3,b.3.c.3 Criterion 1 = 1 Criterion 2 = 1  2 out of 2 = 1 0 or 1 out of 2 = 0  Possible Scores 1, 0  <b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 3</b> <b>0 = 0</b>  <b>NOTE: scoring is applied to 4.a.3, 4.b.3, and 4.c.3</b>

Test item	Criteria to apply	What constitutes competent	Notes on scoring	Score, and weighted score
<b>B. 5 Additional research steps</b>				
<p>B.5 In addition to the three sources you've selected, describe in two or three sentences at least two additional research steps you might take to adequately address the research question</p>	<p>B.5 The student presents at least 2 possible and plausible research steps to revise the search strategy by identifying other investigative methods or retrieval systems, and/or type of source on the topic.</p>	<p>B.5 The criterion is met.</p>	<p>B.5 Examples of appropriate responses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>Ask a librarian, or a professor of law. Identify additional keywords or subject headings to use in searches.</i></li> <li>✓ <i>A visit to several college campuses and an interview with campus newspaper writers might be informative, as well as a search through back issues of several campus newspapers.</i></li> <li>✓ <i>I would search other Internet sources and follow up on links. Another good source would be the reference section of the college library, and also interviewing students involved in censorship incidents.</i></li> </ul> <p>Examples of inadequate responses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>Try the catalog.</i></li> <li>✓ <i>Go in person to another library, or watch a good news program.</i></li> <li>✓ <i>I'd spend some time online at the library going through the catalog and I'd go through different online resources just to see what information I could obtain.</i></li> </ul>	<p>B.5 Each possible and plausible research step = 1</p> <p>2 out of 2 = 1 0 or 1 out of 2 = 0</p> <p>Possible Scores 1, 0</p> <p><b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 7</b> <b>0 = 0</b></p>
<b>EXERCISE III – B.6.a,b Evaluation of Web resources</b>				
<p>B.6.a,b Imagine that you are researching <b>melatonin</b> for a health science research paper. You have found the three Web pages listed below. Visit each one. Then pick two of them. In two or three sentences, explain why you would or would not use these sites for your paper, based on several standard evaluative criteria. Be as specific as possible.</p>	<p>B.6.a,b Criterion 1 – The student states a conclusion about whether would use the site or not. <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 – The student supports this conclusion based on at least 3 standard evaluative criteria (e.g., accuracy, authority, coverage, currency, and objectivity).</p>	<p>B.6.a,b Criterion 1 is met. <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 is met.</p>	<p>B.6.a,b The description must include a brief discussion as to why or why not the student would use the Web site based on evaluative criteria. Applying the criteria means that there is a thoughtful analysis of the criteria in relation to the Web site. Terms or concepts that may be employed for the criteria include: accuracy; authority; coverage; currency or timeliness; objectivity.</p> <p>Examples of appropriate responses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>I would use this Web site because, although it is a .com (commercial site), the information is reliable. The Web site is a network of quality biomedical journals written by physicians and backed up by credible sources, research, and experts. This source is several years old, but gives a well documented, thorough overview of (continued on next page)</i></li> </ul>	<p>B.6.a,b Criterion 1 = 1</p> <p>For Criterion 2: 3 out of 3 = 1 0, 1, or 2 out of 3 = 0</p> <p>Both Criterion 1 and Criterion 2 must be met.</p> <p>Possible scores: 2, 1, 0</p> <p><b>Weighted score</b> <b>2 = 10</b> <b>0, 1 = 0</b></p> <p><b>NOTE: scoring is applied to 6.a and 6.b</b></p>

Test item	Criteria to apply	What constitutes competent	Notes on scoring	Score, and weighted score
			<p><i>the uses and benefits of melatonin, and includes possible adverse effects in order to give a well-balanced overview.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>No, I would not use this Web site. There is very little information on melatonin presented. The site does not present enough research. Also, the information is rather dated.</i></li> </ul> <p>Examples of inadequate responses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>This site contains well-organized information on the topic. It has sub-headings with descriptions along with the focused explanations. [descriptive, not evaluative; no statement of conclusion about whether or not to use the site]</i></li> <li>✓ <i>I would not use this Web site for research. The Web site discusses ways that would prevent a person from getting a good night's sleep and only briefly discusses melatonin. [student's conclusion is included, but what student has written is not evaluative]</i></li> </ul>	
<b>B.7 Synthesis of information in own words</b>				
<p>B.7 Using information found at <a href="http://www.aafp.org/afp/971991ap/cupp.html">http://www.aafp.org/afp/971991ap/cupp.html</a> describe in your own words the uses of melatonin.</p>	<p>B.7 Criterion 1 – Description is a summary of two or more uses of melatonin. <b>AND</b> Criterion 2 – Description is coherently written in the student's own words. <b>AND</b> Criterion 3 – The description reflects the information from the Web site.</p>	<p>B.7 All 3 Criteria are met.</p>	<p>B.7 <b>NOTE</b> The test item prompt asks students to describe the <i>uses</i> of melatonin (i.e., more than one). The Web page also discusses how scientific evidence for some of these uses is lacking. Student responses may mention the uses <i>and</i> comment on the lack of evidence. The first is required; the second is not.</p> <p><b>Excerpt from first paragraph of original text (i.e., exact quotation from the original)</b> Melatonin, a hormone produced by the pineal gland, appears to help regulate the sleep-wake cycle. With further study and clinical experience, it may become an accepted therapy for insomnia.</p> <p><b>Examples of plagiarized versions of this text</b> Plagiarism is copying text exactly as is. Keeping the same sequence of ideas and virtually the same language is also plagiarism. (continued on next page)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>Scientists find that melatonin, a hormone of</i></li> </ul>	<p>B.7 Criterion 1 = 1 Criterion 2 = 1 Criterion 3 = 1 3 out of 3 = 1 0,1, or 2 out of 3 = 0</p> <p>Possible scores 1, 0</p> <p><b>Weighted score</b> <b>1 = 9</b> <b>0 = 0</b></p>

Test item	Criteria to apply	What constitutes competent	Notes on scoring	Score, and weighted score
			<p><i>the pineal gland, appears to regulate the sleep-wake cycle. With additional study, physicians are likely to accept it as a therapy for insomnia and perhaps jet-lag.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>Melatonin is made by the pineal gland and it seems to contribute to regulating the sleep-wake cycle. It could come to be used for insomnia and other sleep disorders.</i></li> <li>✓ <i>A hormone produced by the pineal gland, melatonin appears to help regulate the cycle of sleeping and waking, and thus gets used to cure insomnia and related problems.</i></li> </ul> <p>Examples of acceptable summaries in students' own words</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>Since the hormone melatonin is related as a regulator to the sleep cycle, some people use it to treat sleep disorders of various sorts, e.g., insomnia, and jet lag. Although not supported by solid research findings, people also use it to treat cancer and a variety of other diseases.</i></li> <li>✓ <i>Some people use melatonin to treat sleep disorders of various sorts, e.g., insomnia and also jet lag. People have also used it to treat cancer and a variety of other ills.</i></li> </ul> <p>Examples of inadequate, but non-plagiarized, summaries</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ <i>A hormone that is used to treat insomnia.</i> [the test prompt asked for <i>uses</i> of melatonin; this response refers to only one use]</li> <li>✓ <i>Jet lag, insomnia, prevention of heart attacks and strokes.</i> [this is a <u>list</u> of uses, not a summary in student's own words.]</li> </ul> <p>Scorers will want to visit the Web site and become familiar with the words and phrases that are used so they can determine when students are using their own words to synthesize information.</p>	

Last rev. 8/19/03